

# Semantics and Verification of Software

## Lecture 5: Basic Fixpoint Theory

Thomas Noll

Lehrstuhl für Informatik 2  
RWTH Aachen University  
noll@cs.rwth-aachen.de

<http://www-i2.informatik.rwth-aachen.de/i2/svsw/>

Summer semester 2007

- 1 Repetition: Denotational Semantics
- 2 Characterization of  $\text{fix}(\Phi)$
- 3 Chain-Complete Partial Orders

## Definition (Denotational semantics of statements)

The (denotational) semantic functional for statements,

$$\mathfrak{C}[\cdot] : Cmd \rightarrow (\Sigma \rightarrow \Sigma),$$

is given by:

$$\begin{aligned}\mathfrak{C}[\text{skip}] &:= \text{id}_\Sigma \\ \mathfrak{C}[x := a]\sigma &:= \sigma[x \mapsto \mathfrak{A}[a]\sigma] \\ \mathfrak{C}[c_1; c_2] &:= \mathfrak{C}[c_2] \circ \mathfrak{C}[c_1] \\ \mathfrak{C}[\text{if } b \text{ then } c_1 \text{ else } c_2] &:= \text{cond}(\mathfrak{B}[b], \mathfrak{C}[c_1], \mathfrak{C}[c_2]) \\ \mathfrak{C}[\text{while } b \text{ do } c] &:= \text{fix}(\Phi)\end{aligned}$$

where  $\Phi : (\Sigma \rightarrow \Sigma) \rightarrow (\Sigma \rightarrow \Sigma) : f \mapsto \text{cond}(\mathfrak{B}[b], f \circ \mathfrak{C}[c], \text{id}_\Sigma)$

# Why Fixpoints?

- Goal: preserve **validity of equivalence**

$$\mathfrak{C}[\text{while } b \text{ do } c] = \mathfrak{C}[\text{if } b \text{ then } (c; \text{while } b \text{ do } c) \text{ else skip}]$$

- Using the known parts of Def. 4.8, we obtain:

$$\begin{aligned}\mathfrak{C}[\text{while } b \text{ do } c] &= \mathfrak{C}[\text{if } b \text{ then } (c; \text{while } b \text{ do } c) \text{ else skip}] \\ &= \text{cond}(\mathfrak{B}[b], \mathfrak{C}[c; \text{while } b \text{ do } c], \mathfrak{C}[\text{skip}]) \\ &= \text{cond}(\mathfrak{B}[b], \mathfrak{C}[\text{while } b \text{ do } c] \circ \mathfrak{C}[c], \text{id}_\Sigma)\end{aligned}$$

- Abbreviating  $f := \mathfrak{C}[\text{while } b \text{ do } c]$  this yields:

$$f = \text{cond}(\mathfrak{B}[b], f \circ \mathfrak{C}[c], \text{id}_\Sigma)$$

- Hence  $f$  must be a **solution** of this recursive equation

- Or:  $f$  must be a **fixpoint** of the mapping

$$\Phi : (\Sigma \rightarrow \Sigma) \rightarrow (\Sigma \rightarrow \Sigma) : f \mapsto \text{cond}(\mathfrak{B}[b], f \circ \mathfrak{C}[c], \text{id}_\Sigma)$$

(since the equation can be stated as  $f = \Phi(f)$ )

**But:** fixpoint property not sufficient to obtain a well-defined semantics

**Existence:** there does no need to exist any fixpoint. Examples:

- ①  $\phi_1 : \mathbb{N} \rightarrow \mathbb{N} : n \mapsto n + 1$  has no fixpoint
- ②  $\Phi_1 : (\Sigma \rightarrow \Sigma) \rightarrow (\Sigma \rightarrow \Sigma) : f \mapsto \begin{cases} g_1 & \text{if } f = g_2 \\ g_2 & \text{otherwise} \end{cases}$   
(where  $g_1 \neq g_2$ ) has no fixpoint

**Solution:** in our setting, **fixpoints always exist**

**Uniqueness:** there might exist several fixpoints. Examples:

- ①  $\phi_2 : \mathbb{N} \rightarrow \mathbb{N} : n \mapsto n^3$  has fixpoints  $\{0, 1\}$
- ② every state transformation  $f$  is a fixpoint of  
 $\Phi_2 : (\Sigma \rightarrow \Sigma) \rightarrow (\Sigma \rightarrow \Sigma) : f \mapsto f$

**Solution:** guaranteed by **choosing a special fixpoint**

- 1 Repetition: Denotational Semantics
- 2 Characterization of  $\text{fix}(\Phi)$
- 3 Chain-Complete Partial Orders

- Let  $b \in BExp$  and  $c \in Cmd$
- Let  $\Phi(f) := \text{cond}(\mathfrak{B}[b], f \circ \mathfrak{C}[c], \text{id}_\Sigma)$
- Let  $f_0 : \Sigma \rightarrow \Sigma$  be a fixpoint of  $\Phi$ , i.e.,  $\Phi(f_0) = f_0$
- Given some initial state  $\sigma_0 \in \Sigma$ , we will distinguish the following cases:
  - ➊ loop while  $b$  do  $c$  terminates after  $n$  iterations ( $n \in \mathbb{N}$ )
  - ➋ body  $c$  diverges in the  $n$ th iteration (since it contains a non-terminating while statement)
  - ➌ loop while  $b$  do  $c$  itself diverges

- Let  $b \in BExp$  and  $c \in Cmd$
- Let  $\Phi(f) := \text{cond}(\mathfrak{B}\llbracket b \rrbracket, f \circ \mathfrak{C}\llbracket c \rrbracket, \text{id}_\Sigma)$
- Let  $f_0 : \Sigma \rightarrow \Sigma$  be a fixpoint of  $\Phi$ , i.e.,  $\Phi(f_0) = f_0$
- Given some initial state  $\sigma_0 \in \Sigma$ , we will distinguish the following cases:
  - ➊ loop while  $b$  do  $c$  terminates after  $n$  iterations ( $n \in \mathbb{N}$ )
  - ➋ body  $c$  diverges in the  $n$ th iteration (since it contains a non-terminating while statement)
  - ➌ loop while  $b$  do  $c$  itself diverges

- Let  $b \in BExp$  and  $c \in Cmd$
- Let  $\Phi(f) := \text{cond}(\mathfrak{B}\llbracket b \rrbracket, f \circ \mathfrak{C}\llbracket c \rrbracket, \text{id}_\Sigma)$
- Let  $f_0 : \Sigma \rightarrow \Sigma$  be a fixpoint of  $\Phi$ , i.e.,  $\Phi(f_0) = f_0$
- Given some initial state  $\sigma_0 \in \Sigma$ , we will distinguish the following cases:
  - ➊ loop while  $b$  do  $c$  terminates after  $n$  iterations ( $n \in \mathbb{N}$ )
  - ➋ body  $c$  diverges in the  $n$ th iteration (since it contains a non-terminating while statement)
  - ➌ loop while  $b$  do  $c$  itself diverges

- Let  $b \in BExp$  and  $c \in Cmd$
- Let  $\Phi(f) := \text{cond}(\mathfrak{B}\llbracket b \rrbracket, f \circ \mathfrak{C}\llbracket c \rrbracket, \text{id}_\Sigma)$
- Let  $f_0 : \Sigma \rightarrow \Sigma$  be a fixpoint of  $\Phi$ , i.e.,  $\Phi(f_0) = f_0$
- Given some initial state  $\sigma_0 \in \Sigma$ , we will distinguish the following cases:
  - ① loop `while b do c` terminates after  $n$  iterations ( $n \in \mathbb{N}$ )
  - ② body  $c$  diverges in the  $n$ th iteration (since it contains a non-terminating `while` statement)
  - ③ loop `while b do c` itself diverges

# Case 1: Termination of Loop

- Loop `while b do c` terminates after  $n$  iterations ( $n \in \mathbb{N}$ )

- Formally: there exist  $\sigma_1, \dots, \sigma_n \in \Sigma$  such that

$$\mathfrak{B}[b]\sigma_i = \begin{cases} \text{true} & \text{if } 0 \leq i < n \\ \text{false} & \text{if } i = n \end{cases} \quad \text{and}$$
$$\mathfrak{C}[c]\sigma_i = \sigma_{i+1} \quad \text{for every } 0 \leq i < n$$

- Now the definition

$\Phi(f) := \text{cond}(\mathfrak{B}[b], f \circ \mathfrak{C}[c], \text{id}_\Sigma)$  implies, for every  $0 \leq i < n$ ,

$$\begin{aligned} \Phi(f_0)(\sigma_i) &= (f_0 \circ \mathfrak{C}[c])(\sigma_i) && \text{since } \mathfrak{B}[b]\sigma_i = \text{true} \\ &= f_0(\sigma_{i+1}) && \text{and} \end{aligned}$$

$$\Phi(f_0)(\sigma_n) = \sigma_n \quad \text{since } \mathfrak{B}[b]\sigma_n = \text{false}$$

- Since  $\Phi(f_0) = f_0$  it follows that

$$f_0(\sigma_i) = \begin{cases} f_0(\sigma_{i+1}) & \text{if } 0 \leq i < n \\ \sigma_n & \text{if } i = n \end{cases}$$

and hence

$$f_0(\sigma_0) = f_0(\sigma_1) = \dots = f_0(\sigma_n) = \sigma_n$$

⇒ All fixpoints coincide on  $\sigma_0$ !

# Case 1: Termination of Loop

- Loop `while b do c` terminates after  $n$  iterations ( $n \in \mathbb{N}$ )

- Formally: there exist  $\sigma_1, \dots, \sigma_n \in \Sigma$  such that

$$\mathfrak{B}[\![b]\!]\sigma_i = \begin{cases} \text{true} & \text{if } 0 \leq i < n \\ \text{false} & \text{if } i = n \end{cases} \quad \text{and}$$
$$\mathfrak{C}[\![c]\!]\sigma_i = \sigma_{i+1} \quad \text{for every } 0 \leq i < n$$

- Now the definition

$\Phi(f) := \text{cond}(\mathfrak{B}[\![b]\!], f \circ \mathfrak{C}[\![c]\!], \text{id}_\Sigma)$  implies, for every  $0 \leq i < n$ ,

$$\begin{aligned} \Phi(f_0)(\sigma_i) &= (f_0 \circ \mathfrak{C}[\![c]\!])(\sigma_i) && \text{since } \mathfrak{B}[\![b]\!]\sigma_i = \text{true} \\ &= f_0(\sigma_{i+1}) && \text{and} \end{aligned}$$

$$\Phi(f_0)(\sigma_n) = \sigma_n \quad \text{since } \mathfrak{B}[\![b]\!]\sigma_n = \text{false}$$

- Since  $\Phi(f_0) = f_0$  it follows that

$$f_0(\sigma_i) = \begin{cases} f_0(\sigma_{i+1}) & \text{if } 0 \leq i < n \\ \sigma_n & \text{if } i = n \end{cases}$$

and hence

$$f_0(\sigma_0) = f_0(\sigma_1) = \dots = f_0(\sigma_n) = \sigma_n$$

⇒ All fixpoints coincide on  $\sigma_0$ !

# Case 1: Termination of Loop

- Loop `while b do c` terminates after  $n$  iterations ( $n \in \mathbb{N}$ )

- Formally: there exist  $\sigma_1, \dots, \sigma_n \in \Sigma$  such that

$$\mathfrak{B}[\![b]\!]\sigma_i = \begin{cases} \text{true} & \text{if } 0 \leq i < n \\ \text{false} & \text{if } i = n \end{cases} \quad \text{and}$$
$$\mathfrak{C}[\![c]\!]\sigma_i = \sigma_{i+1} \quad \text{for every } 0 \leq i < n$$

- Now the definition

$\Phi(f) := \text{cond}(\mathfrak{B}[\![b]\!], f \circ \mathfrak{C}[\![c]\!], \text{id}_\Sigma)$  implies, for every  $0 \leq i < n$ ,

$$\begin{aligned} \Phi(f_0)(\sigma_i) &= (f_0 \circ \mathfrak{C}[\![c]\!])(\sigma_i) && \text{since } \mathfrak{B}[\![b]\!]\sigma_i = \text{true} \\ &= f_0(\sigma_{i+1}) && \text{and} \end{aligned}$$

$$\Phi(f_0)(\sigma_n) = \sigma_n \quad \text{since } \mathfrak{B}[\![b]\!]\sigma_n = \text{false}$$

- Since  $\Phi(f_0) = f_0$  it follows that

$$f_0(\sigma_i) = \begin{cases} f_0(\sigma_{i+1}) & \text{if } 0 \leq i < n \\ \sigma_n & \text{if } i = n \end{cases}$$

and hence

$$f_0(\sigma_0) = f_0(\sigma_1) = \dots = f_0(\sigma_n) = \sigma_n$$

⇒ All fixpoints coincide on  $\sigma_0$ !

# Case 1: Termination of Loop

- Loop `while b do c` terminates after  $n$  iterations ( $n \in \mathbb{N}$ )

- Formally: there exist  $\sigma_1, \dots, \sigma_n \in \Sigma$  such that

$$\mathfrak{B}[\![b]\!]\sigma_i = \begin{cases} \text{true} & \text{if } 0 \leq i < n \\ \text{false} & \text{if } i = n \end{cases} \quad \text{and}$$
$$\mathfrak{C}[\![c]\!]\sigma_i = \sigma_{i+1} \quad \text{for every } 0 \leq i < n$$

- Now the definition

$\Phi(f) := \text{cond}(\mathfrak{B}[\![b]\!], f \circ \mathfrak{C}[\![c]\!], \text{id}_\Sigma)$  implies, for every  $0 \leq i < n$ ,

$$\begin{aligned} \Phi(f_0)(\sigma_i) &= (f_0 \circ \mathfrak{C}[\![c]\!])(\sigma_i) && \text{since } \mathfrak{B}[\![b]\!]\sigma_i = \text{true} \\ &= f_0(\sigma_{i+1}) && \text{and} \end{aligned}$$

$$\Phi(f_0)(\sigma_n) = \sigma_n \quad \text{since } \mathfrak{B}[\![b]\!]\sigma_n = \text{false}$$

- Since  $\Phi(f_0) = f_0$  it follows that

$$f_0(\sigma_i) = \begin{cases} f_0(\sigma_{i+1}) & \text{if } 0 \leq i < n \\ \sigma_n & \text{if } i = n \end{cases}$$

and hence

$$f_0(\sigma_0) = f_0(\sigma_1) = \dots f_0(\sigma_n) = \sigma_n$$

→ All fixpoints coincide on  $\sigma_0$ !

# Case 1: Termination of Loop

- Loop `while b do c` terminates after  $n$  iterations ( $n \in \mathbb{N}$ )

- Formally: there exist  $\sigma_1, \dots, \sigma_n \in \Sigma$  such that

$$\mathfrak{B}[\![b]\!]\sigma_i = \begin{cases} \text{true} & \text{if } 0 \leq i < n \\ \text{false} & \text{if } i = n \end{cases} \quad \text{and}$$
$$\mathfrak{C}[\![c]\!]\sigma_i = \sigma_{i+1} \quad \text{for every } 0 \leq i < n$$

- Now the definition

$\Phi(f) := \text{cond}(\mathfrak{B}[\![b]\!], f \circ \mathfrak{C}[\![c]\!], \text{id}_\Sigma)$  implies, for every  $0 \leq i < n$ ,

$$\begin{aligned} \Phi(f_0)(\sigma_i) &= (f_0 \circ \mathfrak{C}[\![c]\!])(\sigma_i) && \text{since } \mathfrak{B}[\![b]\!]\sigma_i = \text{true} \\ &= f_0(\sigma_{i+1}) && \text{and} \end{aligned}$$

$$\Phi(f_0)(\sigma_n) = \sigma_n \quad \text{since } \mathfrak{B}[\![b]\!]\sigma_n = \text{false}$$

- Since  $\Phi(f_0) = f_0$  it follows that

$$f_0(\sigma_i) = \begin{cases} f_0(\sigma_{i+1}) & \text{if } 0 \leq i < n \\ \sigma_n & \text{if } i = n \end{cases}$$

and hence

$$f_0(\sigma_0) = f_0(\sigma_1) = \dots f_0(\sigma_n) = \sigma_n$$

⇒ All fixpoints coincide on  $\sigma_0$ !

## Case 2: Divergence of Body

- Body  $c$  diverges in the  $n$ th iteration (since it contains a non-terminating **while** statement)
- Formally: there exist  $\sigma_1, \dots, \sigma_{n-1} \in \Sigma$  such that

$$\mathfrak{B}[b]\sigma_i = \text{true} \quad \text{for every } 0 \leq i < n \text{ and}$$
$$\mathfrak{C}[c]\sigma_i = \begin{cases} \sigma_{i+1} & \text{if } 0 \leq i \leq n-2 \\ \text{undefined} & \text{if } i = n-1 \end{cases}$$

- Just as in the previous case (setting  $\sigma_n := \text{undefined}$ ) it follows that

$$f_0(\sigma_0) = \text{undefined}$$

⇒ Again all fixpoints coincide on  $\sigma_0$ !

## Case 2: Divergence of Body

- Body  $c$  diverges in the  $n$ th iteration (since it contains a non-terminating `while` statement)
- Formally: there exist  $\sigma_1, \dots, \sigma_{n-1} \in \Sigma$  such that

$$\begin{aligned}\mathfrak{B}[\![b]\!]\sigma_i &= \text{true} && \text{for every } 0 \leq i < n \text{ and} \\ \mathfrak{C}[\![c]\!]\sigma_i &= \begin{cases} \sigma_{i+1} & \text{if } 0 \leq i \leq n-2 \\ \text{undefined} & \text{if } i = n-1 \end{cases}\end{aligned}$$

- Just as in the previous case (setting  $\sigma_n := \text{undefined}$ ) it follows that

$$f_0(\sigma_0) = \text{undefined}$$

⇒ Again all fixpoints coincide on  $\sigma_0$ !

## Case 2: Divergence of Body

- Body  $c$  diverges in the  $n$ th iteration (since it contains a non-terminating `while` statement)
- Formally: there exist  $\sigma_1, \dots, \sigma_{n-1} \in \Sigma$  such that

$$\mathfrak{B}[\![b]\!]_{\sigma_i} = \text{true} \quad \text{for every } 0 \leq i < n \text{ and}$$
$$\mathfrak{C}[\![c]\!]_{\sigma_i} = \begin{cases} \sigma_{i+1} & \text{if } 0 \leq i \leq n-2 \\ \text{undefined} & \text{if } i = n-1 \end{cases}$$

- Just as in the previous case (setting  $\sigma_n := \text{undefined}$ ) it follows that

$$f_0(\sigma_0) = \text{undefined}$$

⇒ Again all fixpoints coincide on  $\sigma_0$ !

## Case 2: Divergence of Body

- Body  $c$  diverges in the  $n$ th iteration (since it contains a non-terminating `while` statement)
- Formally: there exist  $\sigma_1, \dots, \sigma_{n-1} \in \Sigma$  such that

$$\mathfrak{B}[\![b]\!]_{\sigma_i} = \text{true} \quad \text{for every } 0 \leq i < n \text{ and}$$
$$\mathfrak{C}[\![c]\!]_{\sigma_i} = \begin{cases} \sigma_{i+1} & \text{if } 0 \leq i \leq n-2 \\ \text{undefined} & \text{if } i = n-1 \end{cases}$$

- Just as in the previous case (setting  $\sigma_n := \text{undefined}$ ) it follows that

$$f_0(\sigma_0) = \text{undefined}$$

⇒ Again all fixpoints coincide on  $\sigma_0$ !

## Case 3: Divergence of Loop

- Loop `while b do c` diverges
- Formally: there exist  $\sigma_1, \sigma_2, \dots \in \Sigma$  such that

$$\begin{aligned}\mathfrak{B}[\![b]\!] \sigma_i &= \text{true} & \text{and} \\ \mathfrak{C}[\![c]\!] \sigma_i &= \sigma_{i+1} & \text{for every } i \in \mathbb{N}\end{aligned}$$

- Here only derivable:

$$f_0(\sigma_0) = f_0(\sigma_i) \quad \text{for every } i \in \mathbb{N}$$

⇒ Value of  $f_0(\sigma_0)$  not determined!

## Case 3: Divergence of Loop

- Loop `while b do c` diverges
- Formally: there exist  $\sigma_1, \sigma_2, \dots \in \Sigma$  such that

$$\begin{aligned}\mathfrak{B}[\![b]\!] \sigma_i &= \text{true} & \text{and} \\ \mathfrak{C}[\![c]\!] \sigma_i &= \sigma_{i+1} & \text{for every } i \in \mathbb{N}\end{aligned}$$

- Here only derivable:

$$f_0(\sigma_0) = f_0(\sigma_i) \quad \text{for every } i \in \mathbb{N}$$

⇒ Value of  $f_0(\sigma_0)$  not determined!

## Case 3: Divergence of Loop

- Loop `while b do c` diverges
- Formally: there exist  $\sigma_1, \sigma_2, \dots \in \Sigma$  such that

$$\begin{aligned}\mathfrak{B}[\![b]\!] \sigma_i &= \text{true} & \text{and} \\ \mathfrak{C}[\![c]\!] \sigma_i &= \sigma_{i+1} & \text{for every } i \in \mathbb{N}\end{aligned}$$

- Here only derivable:

$$f_0(\sigma_0) = f_0(\sigma_i) \quad \text{for every } i \in \mathbb{N}$$

⇒ Value of  $f_0(\sigma_0)$  not determined!

## Case 3: Divergence of Loop

- Loop `while b do c` diverges
- Formally: there exist  $\sigma_1, \sigma_2, \dots \in \Sigma$  such that

$$\begin{aligned}\mathfrak{B}[\![b]\!]_{\sigma_i} &= \text{true} & \text{and} \\ \mathfrak{C}[\![c]\!]_{\sigma_i} &= \sigma_{i+1} & \text{for every } i \in \mathbb{N}\end{aligned}$$

- Here only derivable:

$$f_0(\sigma_0) = f_0(\sigma_i) \quad \text{for every } i \in \mathbb{N}$$

⇒ Value of  $f_0(\sigma_0)$  not determined!

# Summary

For  $\Phi(f_0) = f_0$  and initial state  $\sigma_0 \in \Sigma$ , case distinction yields:

- ① Loop `while b do c` terminates after  $n$  iterations ( $n \in \mathbb{N}$ )  
 $\implies f_0(\sigma_0) = \sigma_n$
- ② Body `c` diverges in the  $n$ th iteration  
 $\implies f_0(\sigma_0) = \text{undefined}$
- ③ Loop `while b do c` diverges  
 $\implies$  no condition on  $f_0$  (only  $f_0(\sigma_0) = f_0(\sigma_i)$  for every  $i \in \mathbb{N}$ )

- Not surprising since, e.g., `while true do skip` yields for every  $f : \Sigma \rightarrow \Sigma$

$$\Phi(f) = \text{cond}(\mathfrak{B}[\text{true}], f \circ \mathfrak{C}[\text{skip}], \text{id}_\Sigma) = f$$

- On the other hand, our operational understanding requires, for every  $\sigma_0 \in \Sigma$ ,

$$\mathfrak{C}[\text{while true do skip}]\sigma_0 = \text{undefined}$$

## Conclusion

$\text{fix}(\Phi)$  is the least defined fixpoint of  $\Phi$ .

# Summary

For  $\Phi(f_0) = f_0$  and initial state  $\sigma_0 \in \Sigma$ , case distinction yields:

- ① Loop `while b do c` terminates after  $n$  iterations ( $n \in \mathbb{N}$ )  
 $\implies f_0(\sigma_0) = \sigma_n$
- ② Body `c` diverges in the  $n$ th iteration  
 $\implies f_0(\sigma_0) = \text{undefined}$
- ③ Loop `while b do c` diverges  
 $\implies$  no condition on  $f_0$  (only  $f_0(\sigma_0) = f_0(\sigma_i)$  for every  $i \in \mathbb{N}$ )
- Not surprising since, e.g., `while true do skip` yields for every  $f : \Sigma \rightarrow \Sigma$

$$\Phi(f) = \text{cond}(\mathfrak{B}[\text{true}], f \circ \mathfrak{C}[\text{skip}], \text{id}_\Sigma) = f$$

- On the other hand, our operational understanding requires, for every  $\sigma_0 \in \Sigma$ ,

$$\mathfrak{C}[\text{while true do skip}]\sigma_0 = \text{undefined}$$

## Conclusion

$\text{fix}(\Phi)$  is the least defined fixpoint of  $\Phi$ .

# Summary

For  $\Phi(f_0) = f_0$  and initial state  $\sigma_0 \in \Sigma$ , case distinction yields:

- ① Loop `while b do c` terminates after  $n$  iterations ( $n \in \mathbb{N}$ )  
 $\implies f_0(\sigma_0) = \sigma_n$
- ② Body `c` diverges in the  $n$ th iteration  
 $\implies f_0(\sigma_0) = \text{undefined}$
- ③ Loop `while b do c` diverges  
 $\implies$  no condition on  $f_0$  (only  $f_0(\sigma_0) = f_0(\sigma_i)$  for every  $i \in \mathbb{N}$ )
- Not surprising since, e.g., `while true do skip` yields for every  $f : \Sigma \rightarrow \Sigma$   
$$\Phi(f) = \text{cond}(\mathfrak{B}[\text{true}], f \circ \mathfrak{C}[\text{skip}], \text{id}_\Sigma) = f$$
- On the other hand, our operational understanding requires, for every  $\sigma_0 \in \Sigma$ ,  
$$\mathfrak{C}[\text{while true do skip}]\sigma_0 = \text{undefined}$$

## Conclusion

$\text{fix}(\Phi)$  is the least defined fixpoint of  $\Phi$ .

# Summary

For  $\Phi(f_0) = f_0$  and initial state  $\sigma_0 \in \Sigma$ , case distinction yields:

- ① Loop `while b do c` terminates after  $n$  iterations ( $n \in \mathbb{N}$ )  
 $\implies f_0(\sigma_0) = \sigma_n$
- ② Body `c` diverges in the  $n$ th iteration  
 $\implies f_0(\sigma_0) = \text{undefined}$
- ③ Loop `while b do c` diverges  
 $\implies$  no condition on  $f_0$  (only  $f_0(\sigma_0) = f_0(\sigma_i)$  for every  $i \in \mathbb{N}$ )
- Not surprising since, e.g., `while true do skip` yields for every  $f : \Sigma \rightarrow \Sigma$   
$$\Phi(f) = \text{cond}(\mathfrak{B}[\text{true}], f \circ \mathfrak{C}[\text{skip}], \text{id}_\Sigma) = f$$
- On the other hand, our operational understanding requires, for every  $\sigma_0 \in \Sigma$ ,  
$$\mathfrak{C}[\text{while true do skip}]\sigma_0 = \text{undefined}$$

## Conclusion

$\text{fix}(\Phi)$  is the least defined fixpoint of  $\Phi$ .

To use fixpoint theory, the notion of “least defined” has to be made precise.

- Given  $f, g : \Sigma \rightarrow \Sigma$ , let

$$f \sqsubseteq g \iff \text{for every } \sigma, \sigma' \in \Sigma : f(\sigma) = \sigma' \implies g(\sigma) = \sigma'$$

( $g$  is “at least as defined” as  $f$ )

- Equivalent to requiring

$$\text{graph}(f) \subseteq \text{graph}(g)$$

where

$$\text{graph}(h) := \{(\sigma, \sigma') \mid \sigma \in \Sigma, \sigma' = h(\sigma) \text{ defined}\} \subseteq \Sigma \times \Sigma$$

for every  $h : \Sigma \rightarrow \Sigma$

# Making it Precise I

To use fixpoint theory, the notion of “least defined” has to be made precise.

- Given  $f, g : \Sigma \rightarrow \Sigma$ , let

$$f \sqsubseteq g \iff \text{for every } \sigma, \sigma' \in \Sigma : f(\sigma) = \sigma' \implies g(\sigma) = \sigma'$$

( $g$  is “at least as defined” as  $f$ )

- Equivalent to requiring

$$\text{graph}(f) \subseteq \text{graph}(g)$$

where

$$\text{graph}(h) := \{(\sigma, \sigma') \mid \sigma \in \Sigma, \sigma' = h(\sigma) \text{ defined}\} \subseteq \Sigma \times \Sigma$$

for every  $h : \Sigma \rightarrow \Sigma$

## Example 5.1

Let  $x \in \text{Var}$  be fixed, and let  $f_0, f_1, f_2, f_3 : \Sigma \rightarrow \Sigma$  be given by

$$\begin{aligned}f_0(\sigma) &:= \text{undefined} \\f_1(\sigma) &:= \begin{cases} \sigma & \text{if } \sigma(x) \text{ even} \\ \text{undefined} & \text{otherwise} \end{cases} \\f_2(\sigma) &:= \begin{cases} \sigma & \text{if } \sigma(x) \text{ odd} \\ \text{undefined} & \text{otherwise} \end{cases} \\f_3(\sigma) &:= \sigma\end{aligned}$$

This implies  $f_0 \sqsubseteq f_1 \sqsubseteq f_3$ ,  $f_0 \sqsubseteq f_2 \sqsubseteq f_3$ ,  $f_1 \not\sqsubseteq f_2$ , and  $f_2 \not\sqsubseteq f_1$

## Example 5.1

Let  $x \in \text{Var}$  be fixed, and let  $f_0, f_1, f_2, f_3 : \Sigma \rightarrow \Sigma$  be given by

$$\begin{aligned}f_0(\sigma) &:= \text{undefined} \\f_1(\sigma) &:= \begin{cases} \sigma & \text{if } \sigma(x) \text{ even} \\ \text{undefined} & \text{otherwise} \end{cases} \\f_2(\sigma) &:= \begin{cases} \sigma & \text{if } \sigma(x) \text{ odd} \\ \text{undefined} & \text{otherwise} \end{cases} \\f_3(\sigma) &:= \sigma\end{aligned}$$

This implies  $f_0 \sqsubseteq f_1 \sqsubseteq f_3$ ,  $f_0 \sqsubseteq f_2 \sqsubseteq f_3$ ,  $f_1 \not\sqsubseteq f_2$ , and  $f_2 \not\sqsubseteq f_1$

Now  $\text{fix}(\Phi)$  can be characterized by:

- $\text{fix}(\Phi)$  is a **fixpoint** of  $\Phi$ , i.e.,

$$\Phi(\text{fix}(\Phi)) = \text{fix}(\Phi)$$

- $\text{fix}(\Phi)$  is **minimal** with respect to  $\sqsubseteq$ , i.e., for every  $f_0 : \Sigma \rightarrow \Sigma$  such that  $\Phi(f_0) = f_0$ ,

$$\text{fix}(\Phi) \sqsubseteq f_0$$

## Example 5.2

For while true do skip we obtain for every  $f : \Sigma \rightarrow \Sigma$ :

$$\Phi(f) = \text{cond}(\mathfrak{B}[\text{true}], f \circ \mathfrak{C}[\text{skip}], \text{id}_\Sigma) = f$$

$\Rightarrow \text{fix}(\Phi) = f_\emptyset$  where  $f_\emptyset(\sigma) := \text{undefined}$  for every  $\sigma \in \Sigma$   
(that is,  $\text{graph}(f_\emptyset) = \emptyset$ )

Now  $\text{fix}(\Phi)$  can be characterized by:

- $\text{fix}(\Phi)$  is a **fixpoint** of  $\Phi$ , i.e.,

$$\Phi(\text{fix}(\Phi)) = \text{fix}(\Phi)$$

- $\text{fix}(\Phi)$  is **minimal** with respect to  $\sqsubseteq$ , i.e., for every  $f_0 : \Sigma \rightarrow \Sigma$  such that  $\Phi(f_0) = f_0$ ,

$$\text{fix}(\Phi) \sqsubseteq f_0$$

## Example 5.2

For `while true do skip` we obtain for every  $f : \Sigma \rightarrow \Sigma$ :

$$\Phi(f) = \text{cond}(\mathfrak{B}[\text{true}], f \circ \mathfrak{C}[\text{skip}], \text{id}_\Sigma) = f$$

$\Rightarrow \text{fix}(\Phi) = f_\emptyset$  where  $f_\emptyset(\sigma) := \text{undefined}$  for every  $\sigma \in \Sigma$   
(that is,  $\text{graph}(f_\emptyset) = \emptyset$ )

Now  $\text{fix}(\Phi)$  can be characterized by:

- $\text{fix}(\Phi)$  is a **fixpoint** of  $\Phi$ , i.e.,

$$\Phi(\text{fix}(\Phi)) = \text{fix}(\Phi)$$

- $\text{fix}(\Phi)$  is **minimal** with respect to  $\sqsubseteq$ , i.e., for every  $f_0 : \Sigma \rightarrow \Sigma$  such that  $\Phi(f_0) = f_0$ ,

$$\text{fix}(\Phi) \sqsubseteq f_0$$

## Example 5.2

For `while true do skip` we obtain for every  $f : \Sigma \rightarrow \Sigma$ :

$$\Phi(f) = \text{cond}(\mathfrak{B}[\text{true}], f \circ \mathfrak{C}[\text{skip}], \text{id}_\Sigma) = f$$

$\implies \text{fix}(\Phi) = f_\emptyset$  where  $f_\emptyset(\sigma) := \text{undefined}$  for every  $\sigma \in \Sigma$   
(that is,  $\text{graph}(f_\emptyset) = \emptyset$ )

## Goals:

- Prove **existence** of  $\text{fix}(\Phi)$  for  $\Phi(f) = \text{cond}(\mathfrak{B}[\![b]\!], f \circ \mathfrak{C}[\![c]\!], \text{id}_\Sigma)$
- Show how it can be "**computed**" (more exactly: approximated)

## Sufficient conditions:

on domain  $\Sigma \rightarrow \Sigma$ : chain-complete partial order

on function  $\Phi$ : continuity

## Goals:

- Prove **existence** of  $\text{fix}(\Phi)$  for  $\Phi(f) = \text{cond}(\mathfrak{B}[\![b]\!], f \circ \mathfrak{C}[\![c]\!], \text{id}_\Sigma)$
- Show how it can be "**computed**" (more exactly: approximated)

## Sufficient conditions:

on domain  $\Sigma \rightarrow \Sigma$ : **chain-complete partial order**

on function  $\Phi$ : **continuity**

- 1 Repetition: Denotational Semantics
- 2 Characterization of  $\text{fix}(\Phi)$
- 3 Chain-Complete Partial Orders

## Definition 5.3 (Partial order)

A **partial order (PO)**  $(D, \sqsubseteq)$  consists of a set  $D$ , called **domain**, and of a relation  $\sqsubseteq \subseteq D \times D$  such that, for every  $d_1, d_2, d_3 \in D$ ,

reflexivity:  $d_1 \sqsubseteq d_1$

transitivity:  $d_1 \sqsubseteq d_2$  and  $d_2 \sqsubseteq d_3 \implies d_1 \sqsubseteq d_3$

antisymmetry:  $d_1 \sqsubseteq d_2$  and  $d_2 \sqsubseteq d_1 \implies d_1 = d_2$

It is called **total** if, in addition, always  $d_1 \sqsubseteq d_2$  or  $d_2 \sqsubseteq d_1$ .

## Example 5.4

- ➊  $(\mathbb{N}, \leq)$  is a total partial order
- ➋  $(2^{\mathbb{N}}, \subseteq)$  is a (non-total) partial order
- ➌  $(\mathbb{N}, <)$  is not a partial order (since not reflexive)

## Definition 5.3 (Partial order)

A **partial order (PO)**  $(D, \sqsubseteq)$  consists of a set  $D$ , called **domain**, and of a relation  $\sqsubseteq \subseteq D \times D$  such that, for every  $d_1, d_2, d_3 \in D$ ,

reflexivity:  $d_1 \sqsubseteq d_1$

transitivity:  $d_1 \sqsubseteq d_2$  and  $d_2 \sqsubseteq d_3 \implies d_1 \sqsubseteq d_3$

antisymmetry:  $d_1 \sqsubseteq d_2$  and  $d_2 \sqsubseteq d_1 \implies d_1 = d_2$

It is called **total** if, in addition, always  $d_1 \sqsubseteq d_2$  or  $d_2 \sqsubseteq d_1$ .

## Example 5.4

- ①  $(\mathbb{N}, \leq)$  is a total partial order
- ②  $(2^{\mathbb{N}}, \subseteq)$  is a (non-total) partial order
- ③  $(\mathbb{N}, <)$  is not a partial order (since not reflexive)

## Definition 5.3 (Partial order)

A **partial order (PO)**  $(D, \sqsubseteq)$  consists of a set  $D$ , called **domain**, and of a relation  $\sqsubseteq \subseteq D \times D$  such that, for every  $d_1, d_2, d_3 \in D$ ,

reflexivity:  $d_1 \sqsubseteq d_1$

transitivity:  $d_1 \sqsubseteq d_2$  and  $d_2 \sqsubseteq d_3 \implies d_1 \sqsubseteq d_3$

antisymmetry:  $d_1 \sqsubseteq d_2$  and  $d_2 \sqsubseteq d_1 \implies d_1 = d_2$

It is called **total** if, in addition, always  $d_1 \sqsubseteq d_2$  or  $d_2 \sqsubseteq d_1$ .

## Example 5.4

- ①  $(\mathbb{N}, \leq)$  is a total partial order
- ②  $(2^{\mathbb{N}}, \subseteq)$  is a (non-total) partial order
- ③  $(\mathbb{N}, <)$  is not a partial order (since not reflexive)

## Definition 5.3 (Partial order)

A **partial order (PO)**  $(D, \sqsubseteq)$  consists of a set  $D$ , called **domain**, and of a relation  $\sqsubseteq \subseteq D \times D$  such that, for every  $d_1, d_2, d_3 \in D$ ,

reflexivity:  $d_1 \sqsubseteq d_1$

transitivity:  $d_1 \sqsubseteq d_2$  and  $d_2 \sqsubseteq d_3 \implies d_1 \sqsubseteq d_3$

antisymmetry:  $d_1 \sqsubseteq d_2$  and  $d_2 \sqsubseteq d_1 \implies d_1 = d_2$

It is called **total** if, in addition, always  $d_1 \sqsubseteq d_2$  or  $d_2 \sqsubseteq d_1$ .

## Example 5.4

- ①  $(\mathbb{N}, \leq)$  is a total partial order
- ②  $(2^{\mathbb{N}}, \subseteq)$  is a (non-total) partial order
- ③  $(\mathbb{N}, <)$  is not a partial order (since not reflexive)

## Definition 5.3 (Partial order)

A **partial order (PO)**  $(D, \sqsubseteq)$  consists of a set  $D$ , called **domain**, and of a relation  $\sqsubseteq \subseteq D \times D$  such that, for every  $d_1, d_2, d_3 \in D$ ,

reflexivity:  $d_1 \sqsubseteq d_1$

transitivity:  $d_1 \sqsubseteq d_2$  and  $d_2 \sqsubseteq d_3 \implies d_1 \sqsubseteq d_3$

antisymmetry:  $d_1 \sqsubseteq d_2$  and  $d_2 \sqsubseteq d_1 \implies d_1 = d_2$

It is called **total** if, in addition, always  $d_1 \sqsubseteq d_2$  or  $d_2 \sqsubseteq d_1$ .

## Example 5.4

- ①  $(\mathbb{N}, \leq)$  is a total partial order
- ②  $(2^{\mathbb{N}}, \subseteq)$  is a (non-total) partial order
- ③  $(\mathbb{N}, <)$  is not a partial order (since not reflexive)

## Lemma 5.5

$(\Sigma \rightarrow \Sigma, \sqsubseteq)$  is a partial order.

Proof.

see exercise



## Lemma 5.5

$(\Sigma \rightarrow \Sigma, \sqsubseteq)$  is a partial order.

## Proof.

see exercise



# Chains and Least Upper Bounds

Definition 5.6 (Chain, (least) upper bound)

Let  $(D, \sqsubseteq)$  be a partial order and  $S \subseteq D$ .

- 1  $S$  is called a **chain** in  $D$  if, for every  $s_1, s_2 \in S$ ,

$$s_1 \sqsubseteq s_2 \text{ or } s_2 \sqsubseteq s_1$$

(that is,  $S$  is a totally ordered subset of  $D$ ).

- 2 An element  $d \in D$  is called an **upper bound** of  $S$  if  $s \sqsubseteq d$  for every  $s \in S$  (notation:  $S \sqsubseteq d$ ).
- 3 An upper bound  $d$  of  $S$  is called **least upper bound (LUB)** or **supremum** of  $S$  if  $d \sqsubseteq d'$  for every upper bound  $d'$  of  $S$  (notation:  $d = \sqcup S$ ).

Example 5.7

- 1 Every subset  $S \subseteq \mathbb{N}$  is a chain in  $(\mathbb{N}, \leq)$ .  
It has a LUB (its greatest element) iff it is finite.
- 2  $\{\emptyset, \{0\}, \{0, 1\}, \dots\}$  is a chain in  $(2^{\mathbb{N}}, \subseteq)$  with LUB  $\mathbb{N}$ .

# Chains and Least Upper Bounds

Definition 5.6 (Chain, (least) upper bound)

Let  $(D, \sqsubseteq)$  be a partial order and  $S \subseteq D$ .

- 1  $S$  is called a **chain** in  $D$  if, for every  $s_1, s_2 \in S$ ,

$$s_1 \sqsubseteq s_2 \text{ or } s_2 \sqsubseteq s_1$$

(that is,  $S$  is a totally ordered subset of  $D$ ).

- 2 An element  $d \in D$  is called an **upper bound** of  $S$  if  $s \sqsubseteq d$  for every  $s \in S$  (notation:  $S \sqsubseteq d$ ).
- 3 An upper bound  $d$  of  $S$  is called **least upper bound (LUB)** or **supremum** of  $S$  if  $d \sqsubseteq d'$  for every upper bound  $d'$  of  $S$  (notation:  $d = \sqcup S$ ).

Example 5.7

- 1 Every subset  $S \subseteq \mathbb{N}$  is a chain in  $(\mathbb{N}, \leq)$ .  
It has a LUB (its greatest element) iff it is finite.
- 2  $\{\emptyset, \{0\}, \{0, 1\}, \dots\}$  is a chain in  $(2^{\mathbb{N}}, \subseteq)$  with LUB  $\mathbb{N}$ .

# Chains and Least Upper Bounds

Definition 5.6 (Chain, (least) upper bound)

Let  $(D, \sqsubseteq)$  be a partial order and  $S \subseteq D$ .

- 1  $S$  is called a **chain** in  $D$  if, for every  $s_1, s_2 \in S$ ,

$$s_1 \sqsubseteq s_2 \text{ or } s_2 \sqsubseteq s_1$$

(that is,  $S$  is a totally ordered subset of  $D$ ).

- 2 An element  $d \in D$  is called an **upper bound** of  $S$  if  $s \sqsubseteq d$  for every  $s \in S$  (notation:  $S \sqsubseteq d$ ).
- 3 An upper bound  $d$  of  $S$  is called **least upper bound (LUB)** or **supremum** of  $S$  if  $d \sqsubseteq d'$  for every upper bound  $d'$  of  $S$  (notation:  $d = \sqcup S$ ).

Example 5.7

- 1 Every subset  $S \subseteq \mathbb{N}$  is a chain in  $(\mathbb{N}, \leq)$ .  
It has a LUB (its greatest element) iff it is finite.
- 2  $\{\emptyset, \{0\}, \{0, 1\}, \dots\}$  is a chain in  $(2^{\mathbb{N}}, \subseteq)$  with LUB  $\mathbb{N}$ .

# Chains and Least Upper Bounds

Definition 5.6 (Chain, (least) upper bound)

Let  $(D, \sqsubseteq)$  be a partial order and  $S \subseteq D$ .

- ①  $S$  is called a **chain** in  $D$  if, for every  $s_1, s_2 \in S$ ,

$$s_1 \sqsubseteq s_2 \text{ or } s_2 \sqsubseteq s_1$$

(that is,  $S$  is a totally ordered subset of  $D$ ).

- ② An element  $d \in D$  is called an **upper bound** of  $S$  if  $s \sqsubseteq d$  for every  $s \in S$  (notation:  $S \sqsubseteq d$ ).
- ③ An upper bound  $d$  of  $S$  is called **least upper bound (LUB)** or **supremum** of  $S$  if  $d \sqsubseteq d'$  for every upper bound  $d'$  of  $S$  (notation:  $d = \sqcup S$ ).

Example 5.7

- ① Every subset  $S \subseteq \mathbb{N}$  is a chain in  $(\mathbb{N}, \leq)$ .  
It has a LUB (its greatest element) iff it is finite.
- ②  $\{\emptyset, \{0\}, \{0, 1\}, \dots\}$  is a chain in  $(2^{\mathbb{N}}, \subseteq)$  with LUB  $\mathbb{N}$ .

# Chains and Least Upper Bounds

Definition 5.6 (Chain, (least) upper bound)

Let  $(D, \sqsubseteq)$  be a partial order and  $S \subseteq D$ .

- ①  $S$  is called a **chain** in  $D$  if, for every  $s_1, s_2 \in S$ ,

$$s_1 \sqsubseteq s_2 \text{ or } s_2 \sqsubseteq s_1$$

(that is,  $S$  is a totally ordered subset of  $D$ ).

- ② An element  $d \in D$  is called an **upper bound** of  $S$  if  $s \sqsubseteq d$  for every  $s \in S$  (notation:  $S \sqsubseteq d$ ).
- ③ An upper bound  $d$  of  $S$  is called **least upper bound (LUB)** or **supremum** of  $S$  if  $d \sqsubseteq d'$  for every upper bound  $d'$  of  $S$  (notation:  $d = \sqcup S$ ).

Example 5.7

- ① Every subset  $S \subseteq \mathbb{N}$  is a chain in  $(\mathbb{N}, \leq)$ .  
It has a LUB (its greatest element) iff it is finite.
- ②  $\{\emptyset, \{0\}, \{0, 1\}, \dots\}$  is a chain in  $(2^{\mathbb{N}}, \subseteq)$  with LUB  $\mathbb{N}$ .

## Definition 5.8 (Chain completeness)

A partial order is called **chain complete (CCPO)** if every of its chains has a least upper bound.

## Example 5.9

- 1  $(2^{\mathbb{N}}, \subseteq)$  is a CCPO with  $\bigsqcup S = \bigcup_{M \in S} M$  for every chain  $S \subseteq 2^{\mathbb{N}}$ .
- 2  $(\mathbb{N}, \leq)$  is not chain complete  
(since, e.g., the chain  $\mathbb{N}$  has no upper bound).

## Definition 5.8 (Chain completeness)

A partial order is called **chain complete (CCPO)** if every of its chains has a least upper bound.

## Example 5.9

- ➊  $(2^{\mathbb{N}}, \subseteq)$  is a CCPO with  $\bigsqcup S = \bigcup_{M \in S} M$  for every chain  $S \subseteq 2^{\mathbb{N}}$ .
- ➋  $(\mathbb{N}, \leq)$  is not chain complete  
(since, e.g., the chain  $\mathbb{N}$  has no upper bound).

## Definition 5.8 (Chain completeness)

A partial order is called **chain complete (CCPO)** if every of its chains has a least upper bound.

## Example 5.9

- ①  $(2^{\mathbb{N}}, \subseteq)$  is a CCPO with  $\bigsqcup S = \bigcup_{M \in S} M$  for every chain  $S \subseteq 2^{\mathbb{N}}$ .
- ②  $(\mathbb{N}, \leq)$  is not chain complete  
(since, e.g., the chain  $\mathbb{N}$  has no upper bound).

## Definition 5.8 (Chain completeness)

A partial order is called **chain complete (CCPO)** if every of its chains has a least upper bound.

## Example 5.9

- ①  $(2^{\mathbb{N}}, \subseteq)$  is a CCPO with  $\bigsqcup S = \bigcup_{M \in S} M$  for every chain  $S \subseteq 2^{\mathbb{N}}$ .
- ②  $(\mathbb{N}, \leq)$  is not chain complete  
(since, e.g., the chain  $\mathbb{N}$  has no upper bound).

## Corollary 5.10

*Every CCPO has a least element  $\sqcup \emptyset$ .*

Proof.

Let  $(D, \sqsubseteq)$  be a CCPO.

- By definition,  $\emptyset$  is a chain in  $D$ .
- By definition, every  $d \in D$  is an upper bound of  $\emptyset$ .
- Thus  $\sqcup \emptyset$  exists and is the least element of  $D$ .



## Corollary 5.10

*Every CCPO has a least element  $\sqcup \emptyset$ .*

## Proof.

Let  $(D, \sqsubseteq)$  be a CCPO.

- By definition,  $\emptyset$  is a chain in  $D$ .
- By definition, every  $d \in D$  is an upper bound of  $\emptyset$ .
- Thus  $\sqcup \emptyset$  exists and is the least element of  $D$ .



## Corollary 5.10

*Every CCPO has a least element  $\sqcup \emptyset$ .*

## Proof.

Let  $(D, \sqsubseteq)$  be a CCPO.

- By definition,  $\emptyset$  is a chain in  $D$ .
- By definition, every  $d \in D$  is an upper bound of  $\emptyset$ .
- Thus  $\sqcup \emptyset$  exists and is the least element of  $D$ .



## Corollary 5.10

*Every CCPO has a least element  $\sqcup \emptyset$ .*

## Proof.

Let  $(D, \sqsubseteq)$  be a CCPO.

- By definition,  $\emptyset$  is a chain in  $D$ .
- By definition, every  $d \in D$  is an upper bound of  $\emptyset$ .
- Thus  $\sqcup \emptyset$  exists and is the least element of  $D$ .



## Lemma 5.11

- $(\Sigma \rightarrow \Sigma, \sqsubseteq)$  is a CCPo with least element  $f_\emptyset$  where  $\text{graph}(f_\emptyset) = \emptyset$ .
- In particular, for every chain  $S \subseteq \Sigma \rightarrow \Sigma$ ,

$$\text{graph} \left( \bigsqcup S \right) = \bigcup_{f \in S} \text{graph}(f).$$

Proof.

on the board



## Lemma 5.11

- $(\Sigma \rightarrow \Sigma, \sqsubseteq)$  is a CCPo with least element  $f_\emptyset$  where  $\text{graph}(f_\emptyset) = \emptyset$ .
- In particular, for every chain  $S \subseteq \Sigma \rightarrow \Sigma$ ,

$$\text{graph} \left( \bigsqcup S \right) = \bigcup_{f \in S} \text{graph}(f).$$

Proof.

on the board

